

**U.S. Department of Homeland Security**  
**Faith Based Security Advisory Council**  
Hybrid, Open Meeting  
Monday, June 24, 2024  
3:00 – 4:15 P.M. EST

The Faith Based Security Advisory Council (FBSAC) convened on June 24, 2024, from 3:00 – 4:15 P.M. EST. The meeting was open to members of the public under the provisions of the Federal Advisory Committee Act, P.L. 92-463 and 5 U.S.C. § 552b.

**PARTICIPANTS:**

The following individuals participated during the meeting:

**FBSAC Members:**

- Kiran Gill
- Chandru Acharya
- Salam Al-Marayati
- Tracie Baker
- Reverend Dr. Leslie Copeland-Tune
- Hyepin Im
- Curtis Jones
- Michael Masters
- Mayya Saab
- Imam Mohamed Magid
- Chief Issa Shahin
- Kim Burgo
- Imam Dr. Talib M Shareef
- Rabbi Moshe Hauer
- Rabbi Julie Schonfeld
- April Wood
- Todd Richins

**DHS:**

- Alejandro N. Mayorkas, Secretary, Department of Homeland Security
- Fayrouz Saad, Assistant Secretary, Office of Partnership and Engagement (OPE)
- Rebecca Sternhell, Principal Deputy Assistant Secretary, OPE
- Nicole Rosich, Alternate Designated Federal Officer (ADFO), FBSAC
- Erika Amaya, ADFO, FBSAC
- Susan Schneider, ADFO, FBSAC
- Marcus Coleman, Director, DHS Center for Faith-Based and Neighborhood Partnerships

**NICOLE ROSICH** called the meeting to order and introduced herself as the ADFO for the FBSAC. She welcomed the FBSAC members, members of the public, and DHS staff, and overviewed the meeting agenda, reiterating that the meeting is convened in accordance with the Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA) and the meeting minutes and executive summary will be posted online.

**CHAIR KIRAN GILL** thanked the Secretary, the Council, and attendees. She noted the Council was meeting to receive reports from the Subcommittees on Combatting Online Child Exploitation and Abuse (CSEA), Countering Transnational Repression (TNR), and Countering and Responding to Targeted Violence and Terrorism (TVT). She reiterated that Vice Chair Rabbi Julie Schonfeld and herself have immense gratitude for the Subcommittees efforts to gather information, align on findings, and produce recommendations for the Council's

consideration, and for devoting their expertise to these issues. She stated faith-based communities are encountering an increased number of challenges across the country, and the diverse perspectives on the Council, which underpin its work and recommendations, will help DHS work with communities to meet these challenges most effectively. She emphasized that it is critical that their recommendations be acted upon, and that the Council was looking forward to implementation updates from the last round of recommendations presented in June 2023. She then invited Secretary Alejandro N. Mayorkas to provide remarks.

**SECRETARY ALEJANDRO N. MAYORKAS:** “Kiran, thanks for the introduction. Thank you for sharing. We are, of course, going to be discussing a very sobering topic. I thought I would start on a very uplifting note and please join me in congratulating Kiran on being a new parent since we last met.

When we met in November, we had extensive discussion about how our Department can most effectively combat the rise in hate following the October 7<sup>th</sup> terrorist attacks against Israel. Since that time, the number and severity of the attacks have only increased, and I do have a few statistics to share with you that evidence this most unfortunate phenomenon. In the four months after October 7<sup>th</sup>, the FBI opened more than three times more anti-Jewish hate crime investigations than in the four months prior to October 7, 2023. An analysis of data provided by law enforcement agencies from the 25 largest American cities to the Center for the Study of Hate and Extremism at California State University, San Bernardino suggests a 17% increase in hate crimes in 2023 driven by upticks in attacks born of anti-Semitism and Islamophobia. We, in the Department, do not do our work combatting violence born of hate alone. We do it in partnership with communities around this country and we do it in partnership with all of you, so I want to, again, just reiterate our gratitude for your willingness to serve on this Council and take your precious time to assist us in this effort.

We have been actioning the recommendations of this Council and the recommendations of the sister, Homeland Security Academic Partnerships Council (HSAPC), to really strengthen our efforts to combat violence born of hate. We have conducted more than 2,000 engagements with state, local, tribal, territorial and campus law enforcement organizations. We have increased our outreach to faith communities posting safety briefings and distributing materials. We launched a resource, a webpage, and we have deployed our Protective Security Advisors (PSA) around the country. I look forward to hearing of your recommendations on the three lines of effort that Subcommittees have tackled, and I know that some of the recommendations will assist us in this work as well.

The events in Los Angeles just yesterday, bring to the fore, and highlight the significance of the challenge and the fact that the challenge has in no way abated. It is my intention, since we will not be tackling that challenge in substance today, to convene a closed meeting of this Council over the next 60 or so days. We have to be mindful of the fact that we are not only addressing violence born of hate on a day-to-day basis, but the fall semester is around the corner. Certainly, this past school year, did not close on a note of peace and harmony, and an open academic environment for people to express views, however divergent, and I think the two councils working together could have a very important and productive conversation on that.

I know all too well that we are resource challenged in a number of different areas of our work, including in this particular domain of battling violence born of hate. On Friday, we announced the fact that the Biden-Harris Administration has secured a \$390 million plus up of our Non-Profit Security Grant Program (NSGP) funding, and that we are making very soon available \$160 million of that, trying to get it out into the communities as quickly as possible and we are going to make the balance of that funding available later this year. One of the things that we want to do and explore with you is, how we can make additional uses of that funding available; and whether there can be a united, a unity of application, such that perhaps it's not one institution alone, but maybe a group of institutions that can apply for funding. We certainly have traveled to different parts of the country and learn very well of the resource poor, target rich institutions, whether small churches, small mosques, even small synagogues and in remote areas and we have to see how we can make these funds more readily accessible, how we can streamline the process, and how, perhaps together, through a community of action, we can make individual organizations stronger. Very much looking forward to the presentations, Kiran, and just want to express, once again, our profound gratitude. Thank you.”

**NICOLE ROSICH** thanked the Secretary and provided implementation updates from the recommendations presented to the Council on June 6, 2023, on information sharing, increasing access to DHS grants and resources, and building trust and partnerships with faith-based organizations, leaders, and communities. She noted that OPE has and continues to lead and support faith-based engagements in close coordination with the DHS Center for Faith-Based and Neighborhood Partnerships, the Office of Intelligence and Analysis (I&A), the Office of Strategy, Policy, and Plans / Center for Prevention, Programs, and Partnerships (PLCY/CP3), the Office for Civil Rights and Civil Liberties (CRCL) and the Cybersecurity and Infrastructure Security Agency (CISA). These include in-person and virtual listening sessions and roundtable discussions with faith-based organizations (FBOs) and representatives of faith-based communities, federal, state, local, tribal, and territorial (SLTT) partners, and faith-based security practitioners to discuss gaps in information sharing and identify areas for improvement for reporting suspicious activity and incidents.

Ms. Rosich provided updates on the recommendations from the Grants and Resources Subcommittee report on how DHS can most effectively and appropriately share resources that meet the needs of diverse faith-based organizations and communities, including remedying challenges to applying for DHS grants. She reiterated that the Department is committed to improving grant applications to make them more accessible to communities that need them. She highlighted the following:

- The Department announced last week an increase of \$390 million in NSGP funding for faith-based institutions and nonprofit organizations, bringing the total Fiscal Year (FY) 2024 total to over \$664 million.
- The Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA) has implemented changes to the NSGP stakeholder engagement and application review process to advance these goals, including posting a publicly accessible video about the application process and creating the sub-applicant quick start guide using plain language.
- Starting in FY 2022, the NSGP has given nonprofit organizations that had not previously received NSGP funding 15 additional points and nonprofit organizations located within, or serving an underserved community, up to an additional 15 points in their final review

score.

She continued and stated that in addition to these NSGP improvements, the Department has taken several actions to enhance the sharing of resources with faith-based stakeholders.

- OPE, in close coordination with the CISA continues to increase public awareness of free-of-cost and low-cost resources for houses of worship and faith communities.
  - As noted by Secretary Mayorkas, OPE has hosted a number of national webinars in the last year, previewing and providing training for faith-based communities, including one in partnership with the Department of Justice providing information on hate crimes reporting.
  - In March 2024 in Nashville, TN, OPE and CISA kicked off a series of regional community safety trainings for non-governmental organizations (NGOs), including faith-based partners. These sessions provide hands-on training on safety and security resources, preview additional available resources and training opportunities, and allow for partners to connect with their local PSAs, Cyber Security Advisors, Regional Prevention Coordinators, and Intelligence Officers. Additionally, these trainings have allowed for greater connectivity to be built between local organizations in these regions. The second regional training took place in Salt Lake City, UT in March 2024 and the next is scheduled for September 2024 in Boston, MA.

Ms. Rosich continued updates on the recommendations put forth by the FBSAC Building Trust and Partnerships on how the Department can build trust with faith and community stakeholders and empower local leaders to use DHS resources more effectively. To address these key findings and recommendations, Ms. Rosich highlighted how the Department has undertaken a series of directed actions:

- OPE, in coordination with all relevant offices and components, has prioritized proactive outreach to faith-based communities nationally, regionally, and locally. On October 10, 2023, in response to the Israel-Hamas conflict, DHS launched a website that is regularly updated with threat assessments pertaining to the homeland and all relevant resources to keep faith-based communities and institutions safe. This, and other DHS resources and information-sharing efforts, continue to be informed by direct outreach to diverse faith leaders and in response to their communities' time-sensitive security needs.
- DHS has also prioritized connecting local faith-based organizations with their regional I&A Intelligence Officers, CISA PSAs, and other local law enforcement contacts. OPE, in conjunction with other DHS offices and components, will continue to host regular briefings for FBOs and community stakeholders to ensure timely access and information on DHS policies, practices, and procedures, as well as to share timely unclassified intelligence updates with the communities we serve.
- Customs and Border Protection (CBP) recently updated existing policies and procedures to ensure the respectful handling and management of religious attire, articles, and materials. Such policies and procedures regarding the search, seizure, or screening that involves touching, seeking removal of, or confiscating religious attire, articles, or materials shall continue to comply with all relevant laws and regulations including the Religious Freedom Restoration Act (RFRA).

- The Department has taken major steps in making DHS programs and information widely available and accessible to communities with limited English proficiency throughout the country. DHS issued an updated Language Access Plan in November of 2023 establishing language access policy for all DHS agencies and offices that interact with members of the public.
- DHS agencies and offices continue to translate materials to promote access to resources and other information impacting the safety and wellbeing of communities, for example:
  - FEMA has efforts underway to translate materials about the NSGP grant and the application process. Among other products being translated are the FY 2024 NSGP Frequently Asked Questions, Application Checklist, and Grant Writing Tips.
  - The CP3 has translated the Targeted Violence and Terrorism Prevention Grant Program [Fact Sheet](#) into 14 languages.
  - The CRCL developed and issued a [Fact Sheet](#) on Protecting Individuals from Discrimination based on Actual or Perceived Shared Ancestry or Ethnic Characteristics under Title VI of the Civil Rights Act, which is available in 6 languages.
  - CRCL has also supported the Department with handling translations in multiple languages of National Terrorism Advisory System (NTAS) bulletins.
  - Resources on Protecting Houses of Worship in 7 languages, including a video in American Sign Language, and the Power of Hello Houses of Worship Guide continue to be available on the CISA website.
  - As part of the consolidated resources published after the start of the Israel-Hamas conflict, the Department developed and translated [resources](#) for individuals on the threat of doxing.

Ms. Rosich clarified that while this overview does not address all the recommendations previously issued by this Council, the Department continues to work diligently to expand information-sharing, improve access grants and resources, and enhance trust building with our faith-based partners.

She then discussed the agenda of the meeting. She noted that the Sikh Coalition submitted a comment *which has been made available to view with the publication of these minutes*. Ms. Rosich invited April Wood and Chandru Acharya to present the CSEA Subcommittee’s report and recommendations for the Council’s consideration.

**APRIL WOOD** thanked the Secretary, Subcommittee, and overviewed the tasking. She then listed the Subcommittee’s key findings:

1. There is a lack of awareness regarding CSEA and there are challenges in framing conversations around the nature of CSEA. This is a barrier to faith-based communities and their ability to combat online CSEA effectively.
2. The role of technology companies and social media platforms is critical to curbing and combating online CSEA and providing a safe space for children.
3. Children may experience a lack of a safe space within their own households, schools, faith groups, or other communities to bring up CSEA crime-related issues or threats with their parents, trusted adults, or religious and community leaders.

4. Partnerships and multi-agency collaboration play a critical role in maximizing limited resources, sharing information, and augmenting efforts to combat online CSEA, emphasizing that this issue was a common theme.
5. Additional advocacy is needed for legislation to protect children from online CSEA.

**CHANDRU ACHARYA** thanked Ms. Wood and presented the Subcommittee's recommendations:

1. Support and strengthen public awareness programs like Know2Protect and Project iGuardian by expanding funding and designing a strategy to engage faith-based communities.
2. Integrate DHS resources into learning management platforms that are culturally sensitive and multilingual assets used by faith-based communities to ensure access.
3. Create a liaison position within DHS to support agencies across each of DHS' ten regions across the country that can help support DHS initiatives locally and implement these initiatives within faith-based and educational institutions which are where large target audiences frequent.
4. Encourage and incentivize technology companies to prioritize child safety through proactive engagement, collaboration, and regular outreach.
5. Advocate for stronger legislation from congress to protect children and youth from online CSEA investigations.

**SECRETARY MAYORKAS:** "Thank you. Thank you both and thank you to the entire Subcommittee. I should note I see the Imam on the screen, and Imam I learned that you returned from the Hajj, and I wanted to express my sorrow for the tragedy of so many people perishing by reason of the heat."

**IMAM MOHAMED MAGID** expressed his appreciation for the Secretary's sentiment.

**MS. ROSICH** thanked Ms. Wood and Mr. Acharya and opened the public comment period. She explained that each person would have one minute to comment and should raise their hand. After no public comments were made, Ms. Rosich said that public comments will be accepted up to 30 days after the meeting for upload alongside the public record. She then moved to Council deliberation.

**MICHAEL MASTERS** inquired as to whether the Subcommittee found parallels or nexuses with other forms of violence, or threats of violence, in the online space, specifically in the social media space, that would be a natural place to find other partners who could root out violent activity. **MS. WOOD** explained the Subcommittee received briefings from government partners and non-governmental organizations, and had requested statistics, but they weren't available or collected.

**SECRETARY MAYORKAS:** "Michael is your question, some rooms, for example, where particular antisocial behavior is articulated that whether the online child sexual exploitation and abuse behavior is resident there as well, such that we can bring in resources that are focused on the other areas to this fight?"

**MR. MASTERS** clarified that when there is a threat against faith-based communities, they have found other indicators such as violence toward children or animals. Where there are force multipliers, we may be able to identify more than one threat indicator. **MS. WOOD** noted that the financial-motivated crime brought up some interesting discussion around strategic partners.

**SECRETARY MAYORKAS:** “This is a line of effort that we will undertake born of this Subcommittee’s work.”

**ASSISTANT SECRETARY FAYROUZ SAAD** explained that OPE has had meetings with groups countering CSEA and started the Know2Protect campaign. A/S Saad mentioned there is a small overlap, but that OPE can follow up.

**HYEPIN IM** reemphasized many faith organizations’ lack awareness around child sex trafficking. She mentioned she held a certain perception of human trafficking and prostitution, and through educational efforts, that perspective shifted. She has noticed victim-blaming from local pastors, without being aware they are truly victims. She emphasized there is a certain framing for faith-based organizations that is taught and there needs to be heightened educational outreach efforts to help that shift.

**SECRETARY MAYORKAS:** “I appreciate that. We have an opportunity here.”

**NICOLE ROSICH** asked if there are any additional comments from the Council.

**IMAM MOHAMED MAGID** thanked the department and the Secretary for making this a priority because children are the most vulnerable part of our society. He also emphasized the idea of using multiple languages and translating software which is important to educate communities who immigrated to the country recently and don’t speak fluent English. He stated his appreciation for his colleagues in the task forth and for the briefing. He thanked the Secretary again for making this a priority.

**SECRETARY MAYORKAS:** “Thank you, Imam.”

**MR. MASTERS** noted that there was a finding of non-standard practices and procedures from technology companies. He inquired whether this was also true from the law enforcement side and if there was an opportunity for more standardized best practice dissemination with law enforcement agencies around this topic. **MR. ACHARYA** said that there is absolutely a lack of processes and uniformity in each state as it relates to prevention or handling victims, and more needs to be done by individual agencies. The Subcommittee wants more standard and best practices. **TRACIE BAKER** noted that local agencies were working with the task force to implement change. She explained that law enforcement cannot be successful without partnerships on the local and federal level, and having local law enforcement embedded in federal agencies is the only way to make this happen.

**SECRETARY MAYORKAS:** “To bring people together, we should look at the Federal Law Enforcement Training Center (FLETC), and what our programs are and what opportunity exists there.”

**PRINCIPAL DEPUTY ASSISTANT SECRETARY REBECCA STERNHELL** noted that when considering the recommendations of the Homeland Security Advisory Council and HSAPC, one of the recommendations was to create a clearinghouse Fusion Center that ensures all the information is coming to one place and standardized.

**NICOLE ROSICH** asked if there were any other comments.

**VICE CHAIR RABBI JULIE SCHONFELD** mentioned that she had worked on human trafficking at the White House Faith Council. She noticed that many people who were trafficked were undocumented and afraid to come forward due to fear of penalty. She highlighted that vulnerable people, especially children, are disincentivized to contact government agencies.

**SECRETARY MAYORKAS:** “In that regard, Rabbi, we have worked extensively with the community to raise awareness of the T- and U-Visa programs for victims of trafficking specifically, as well as individuals who are assisting in law enforcement work. We also have a number of other parallel lines of effort to make people comfortable coming forward. That certainly has historically been a challenge. We have made a lot of strides there. More to do.”

**MS. ROSICH** asked if there were any other comments. When there were none, motioned to adopt the report as final. **MS. IM** motioned to adopt the report. Ms. Rosich asked if there was a second. **TRACIE BAKER** seconded the motion. Ms. Rosich asked if there were any abstentions. There were not, so Ms. Rosich announced that the report is adopted unanimously and is now deemed a final product of the FBSAC. She thanked Ms. Wood, Mr. Acharya, and the other members of the CSEA subcommittee for their work on the report.

**SECRETARY MAYORKAS:** “Thank you, thank you.”

**MS. ROSICH** invited Chair Michael Masters and Vice Chair Curtis Jones of the TVT subcommittee to present their key findings and recommendations for the council’s consideration.

**MR. MASTERS** thanked his vice chair Curtis Jones, and the rest of the Subcommittee members, Rabbi Schonfeld, Chief Shahin, and Reverend Naomi Washington-Leapheart for their work on this tasking, and the Secretary for pushing this issue forward. Mr. Masters overviewed how the Subcommittee met with key stakeholders in academia, nonprofit, private, and public sectors, including local, state, and federal law enforcement, victims, witnesses, and survivors through briefings and two site visits to impacted communities: one to Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, and the other to Charleston, South Carolina. He thanked the Department for making these visits possible.

Mr. Masters then overviewed the Subcommittee’s tasking. He mentioned how there is an opportunity to ensure organizations are more collaborative and cohesive across the faith-based community. He then shared that this is the fourth report to address the issue of targeted violence, and while there has been significant progress, the recommendations in the last three reports remain largely unaddressed, much of which occur due to resourcing issues. Due to these issues, he stated that the report reaffirms, restates, and updates past recommendations and makes new



ones based on the current threat environment. He noted that past unmet recommendations have been those that directly communicate with the needs of the faith-based community and has left them more vulnerable in the face of a more dynamic threat. He stated that they all have an opportunity to increase safety, security, and prevent the eroding of religious freedom and the basic principles of our democracy. He turned to Mr. Jones to discuss the recommendations.

**CURTIS JONES** thanked Mr. Masters and DHS Staff. He then summarized the key findings made by the Subcommittee:

1. There are scarce resources and many places either do not have the resources or do not have the level of expertise to apply the resources given to their organizations.
2. There are present gaps in sharing, training, and collaborations.
3. There is a need for better liaisons between the federal, state, and local law enforcement while providing timely and credible threat information. He mentioned getting information faster from non-governmental organizations than from DHS.
4. There is a need for the development of security guides and training alongside building community between different faith-based communities.
5. CISA's PSAs are stretched too thin, citing the PSA who covers parts of California are mainly focused on the Department of Defense side, so faith-based communities and areas do not get the attention for their area.
6. There should be a shared document of the information and opportunities available from other organizations made available by DHS to force multiply the information and resources the Department provides.
7. There needs to be a proactive strategy to initiate and then develop relationships of trust within the faith-based community. There is a form of a strategy, but it is not hitting disparate communities, and many lack knowledge of available resources.

**MR. JONES** expressed gratitude to the reforms made to grant programs. He reiterated that the Subcommittee made 25 recommendations focused on the CISA PSAs, nonprofit security grants, and toolkits. He emphasized that visiting Pittsburgh, PA, and Charleston, SC, and meeting with the community members and first responders enhanced the ability to put forth these recommendations. **MR. MASTERS** emphasized Mr. Jones' point on the site visits and highlighted that everyone faces a common threat. Based on the proximity to the oldest synagogue in the United States and the oldest black church in the South, the individual who committed this massacre would have readily taken out his attack on either of the two communities. He then quoted Winston Churchill, "Conquer we must, as conquer we shall," and stated that there is no option but to get this right.

**SECRETARY MAYORKAS:** "Thank you all very much. Thank you, Michael. These kind words are too kind. Thanks to the subcommittee for the work and the recommendations. I'm going to turn it over to Nicole."

**NICOLE ROSICH** thanked Secretary Mayorkas, Mr. Masters, Mr. Jones, and the members of the Subcommittee. She opened the public comment period, and no public comments were made. She noted that public comments will be accepted up to 30 days after the meeting for upload alongside the meeting record. She then moved into council deliberation.

**SECRETARY MAYORKAS:** “There are a lot of different parts of the department that are involved in this work, each with their own series of resources. There are other federal departments and agencies that are involved in this work, and they too have their respective resources. I wonder if one of the challenges of raising awareness of the resources is how federated the resources are, how many there are, whether it’s daunting, or overwhelming, and whether we have to think about an interagency center where we are all co-hosted, and we find some way of streamlining the different lines of effort and the different resources available. Sometimes, less in number does not mean less in quality, reach and impact.”

**MR. MASTERS** agreed with the Secretary and stated that in the TVT Subcommittee report, they suggested that it is the Department’s responsibility to federate the resources within DHS more clearly. He cited two examples where DHS has improved: the activity happening in CISA, and the improvement within OPE under Secretary Mayorkas’ leadership. He reiterated one form of communication would be helpful, and there is more room for growth. One recommendation he made is a one-pager on how to prevent a mass attack in five easy steps that any house of worship can implement. **SECRETARY MAYORKAS** thanked Mr. Masters. **MS. IM** expressed that when people are in new arenas, they feel intimidated. When the faith communities connect with DHS resources, they feel overwhelmed. **SECRETARY MAYORKAS:** “That’s to Michael’s point of the five easy steps that everyone would take.” **MS. IM** continued that having intermediaries, or trusted advisors, who could work with faith organizations could be a way to address Mr. Masters’ suggestions. **MR. MASTERS** emphasized that this is why the CISA PSA program needs more standardization, training requirements, and resources. The relationship of trust is what carries it through.

**SALAM AL-MARAYATI** recognized that one key factor is how DHS and other federal law enforcement agencies can leverage local law enforcement to be the interface with communities to support trust building because of the familiarity already present. He stated this would mitigate the disparity between houses of worship who have small versus large budgets and resources, and local law enforcement can help fill that void.

**CHIEF ISSA SHAHIN** thanked Secretary Mayorkas and the group. He discussed as local law enforcement in Dearborn, Michigan, he has a connection to local faith community leaders that he and his fellow officers built over the last 26 years. He mentioned there is only one PSA for the state of Michigan. He highlighted that when building out the PSA program with more robust training, defining a curriculum for PSAs across the country would qualify them to provide the advice or information that they do. Chief Shahin emphasized the importance of building out the PSA curriculum because as additional resources for grants come available, third-party organizations may fill the void who do not have the best interests of houses of worship in mind as well. He also emphasized the importance of leveraging local law enforcement and providing the same training through FLETC and FEMA to be a force multiplier to guide houses of worship and better safeguard their institutions.

**SECRETARY MAYORKAS:** “Thank you, Chief.”

**MS. ROSICH** asked if there were any additional comments from the Council. After hearing none, she motioned to adopt the report as final. **MR. AL-MARAYATI** motioned to adopt the

report. Ms. Rosich asked if there was a second. **MR. ARCHARYA** seconded the motion. Ms. Rosich called for those in favor of adopting the report, to which the council members replied affirmatively. She then asked if there were any opposed; there were not. She then asked if there were any abstentions. There were not, so Ms. Rosich announced that the report is adopted unanimously and is now deemed a final product of the FBSAC. Ms. Rosich thanked Mr. Masters, Mr. Jones, and the rest of the TVT Subcommittee for the report. She then invited co-chairs Ms. Im and Mr. Richins of the TNR subcommittee to present their findings and recommendations.

**TODD RICHINS** thanked the Secretary for the opportunity to work on the issue and thanked his Subcommittee members for their work and overviewed the taskings.

**MS. IM** provided a working definition of TNR recognizing that it is a relatively new term to the public. She referred to a Wikipedia definition for TNR, stating that TNR refers to acts of political repression conducted by external states targeting political dissidents or critical members of outspoken communities abroad. It can take forms of assassinations or forced disappearances.

Ms. Im began to review the Subcommittee's findings. She highlighted that the lack of a unified definition of TNR contributes to confusion within agencies and causes a lack of a coordinated interagency response and mitigation. Ms. Im also highlighted that no single agency owns the domestic response to TNR, so there is a lack of interagency coordination. Additionally, she mentioned that the avenues for reporting TNR incidents are confusing, and inconsistent responses to these incidents reported have led to further mistrust due to the lack of follow up possibly caused by the lack of universal definition or coordination. She stated that outreach to communities and victims of TNR draws attention to those persons, which could make them heightened targets. She stressed sensitivity on how to engage communities to foster engagement delicately.

Ms. Im provided reasons as to why TNR victims are targeted, including religious affiliation, and a person's political and cultural identity, dissidents, or criticism of their home country's regime. She highlighted inconsistencies in U.S. government response to TNR, particularly when they are committed by an ally compared to a non-ally. She emphasized the need to codify TNR to address TNR threats, and how, without legislative mechanisms, it makes prosecuting cases difficult. She highlighted the NSGP does not call out TNR, so potential candidates may not know if they are eligible. Ms. Im highlighted the power of technology and stated that online threats are just as real for TNR victims, and the resources needed to track and address these are minimal. Ms. Im laid out recommendations to address these issues:

1. Support current or future legislative efforts to create a formal, unified definition of TNR.
2. DHS should work with federal partners to determine which agency or entity leads coordination on TNR response and ensure this agency or entity is required to report out on and provide updates on their actions.
3. Ensure that the government, and in particular DOS, equally identifies and responds to any country that engages in TNR regardless of whether the country is a U.S. ally or adversary.
4. Make reforms to the Nonprofit Security Grant Program (NSGP) to include mitigation of TNR as an allowable category for funding.
5. Train and empower local law enforcement to address cases of TNR.

6. Ensure community outreach and education is accessible to a wide range of communities in targeted populations. This includes providing resources in meaningfully accessible languages, as well as standardizing current TNR resources located on federal websites and those in printed form.
7. Law Enforcement should reach out to, and build trust with, faith communities regarding TNR.
8. Identify a central collection agency for TNR issues to which all local jurisdictions can report. This central collection agency may already exist; however, it should be clearly identified to the public as the central collection and reporting agency.
9. Partner with technology companies and faith organizations to mitigate TNR online and to increase outreach to targeted communities about online safety.
10. Empower existing local Victims Services Programs, or the like, to provide support to the victims and potentially families and communities impacted by incidents of TNR.
11. Collaborate with Five Eyes (FVEYS) partners to identify TNR prevention strategies.

She thanked her co-chair and the Subcommittee members.

**SECRETARY MAYORKAS:** “Thank you so much.”

**MS. ROSICH** opened the floor for public comment.

**GRAHAM WEST [MANAGING DIRECTOR – SIKH COALITION]** expressed gratitude to the committee for their work on the report, highlighting the importance of holding all countries accountable for TNR, whether committed by an adversary or ally. He expressed delight in seeing his organization’s recommendations were being incorporated into the report. He noted that events have happened since briefing the Subcommittee in March making this even more relevant. He noted there have been reports from the Washington Post that identified significant government of India involvement in the 2023 plot to assassinate U.S. based Sikhs. Prime Minister Modi, in the absence of any real diplomatic consequences, has taken to boasting about how his India, “will come into your home and kill you.” Mr. West mentioned that there is more information included in the organization’s submission to the public record and thanked the Council for his chance to comment and their continued focus on this issue area.

**SECRETARY MAYORKAS:** “Thank you very much, Mr. West.”

**MS. ROSICH** asked if there were any other comments. After no more public comments were made, Ms. Rosich said that public comments will be accepted up to 30 days after the meeting for upload alongside the public record. She then moved to Council deliberation.

**MAYYA SAAB** noted one of the starkest findings is that the U.S. needs to call out TNR whether it is occurring via enemies or allies. The concern is that the victims will feel isolated twice over because they are isolated from whoever is perpetrating TNR and then again by the U.S. own government. **MR. AL-MARAYATI** followed up Ms. Saab’s comments, noting two general issues from a policy standpoint. First, some U.S. allies exploit counterterrorism law to excuse their actions and tell the U.S. to backoff from that. He cautioned that these actions must be called out in terms of making sure even within our federal government that policies and

procedures are not allowing that to happen through agents of these foreign governments. Second, Mr. Al-Marayati noted that one of the causes for 9/11 was the repression of many people within the countries that comprised the hijackers who mainly came from allied countries such as Egypt and Saudi Arabia. He warned that we must be careful to see how that can be used to weaponize certain acts of dissidents across the U.S. and prevent another 9/11 from happening. He urged, for that reason, TNR response to be housed under DHS and given priority. **MR. ACHARYA** agreed that TNR is unacceptable from allies and non-allies. He reiterated codification is of paramount importance, and there is a need to define TNR and make sure genuine counterterrorism measures are not undermined in the process. **MS. IM** emphasized that the consistent feedback heard by different organizations on TNR was the lack of transparency and response. She continued by stating that, like reporting a hate crime, it takes a high bar for someone to report TNR because you are putting yourself at risk. By not hearing a response or follow up, or the appearance of none, discourages any further collaboration or cooperation.

**SECRETARY MAYORKAS:** “Is that point expressed in your findings and recommendations?”

**HYEPIN IM** confirmed it was.

**NICOLE ROSICH** asked if the Council had additional comments.

**MR. MASTERS** agreed with Mr. Acharya that TNR requires codification and calls for its own structure writ large in terms of a dedicated funding stream, beyond just language included in the NSGP. He emphasized that the issue is significant enough to require a much more robust and holistic strategy.

**MS. ROSICH** asked if anyone had additional comments. None were made, and she motioned to adopt the report as final. **MS. SAAB** motioned to adopt the report. Ms. Rosich asked if there was a second. **MS. COPELAND-TUNE** seconded the motion. Ms. Rosich called for those in favor of adopting the report, to which the council members replied affirmatively. She then asked if there were any opposed; there were not. Ms. Rosich asked if there were any abstentions. There were not, so Ms. Rosich announced that the report is adopted unanimously and is now deemed a final product of the FBSAC. She then asked if the Secretary had any final remarks.

**SECRETARY MAYORKAS:** “The note that this is the hardest working Council is something that reverberates quite profoundly. I just want to thank everybody for the work, not just the three Subcommittees that have produced these reports, but of course, the entire Council and the prior work that was performed. These are fundamentally important lines of effort. Whether it is TNR, and I think this subject is really in need of much more focus: codification to use that term, a definition that is more encompassing, than just definitional, and raising awareness of it. I do not think we have the architecture in this area that we do in other areas. In whatever stage the other areas are in, this one is lagging, and it is a real call to action. Targeted violence and terrorism prevention, and online child sexual exploitation abuse, these are just pivotally fundamental roles in our Department. I want to thank you all for contributing so mightily to them.”

**MS. ROSICH** thanked the Secretary for his remarks and gave the floor to Rabbi Schonfeld for closing remarks.

**RABBI SCHONFELD** thanked the Secretary, Ms. Rosich, DHS staff, Deloitte team, and everyone else for their contributions. She remarked that while in Moynihan Train Hall before arriving to the meeting, she looked up and saw the Latin phrase “E pluribus Unum,” out of many, one. She noted the task at hand was heavy, and this is a heavy time. She remarked that this is a time of ‘E pluribus’ where there has been a need to express our many identities, justifiably so, necessarily so, and a very important part of the constructive growth of our country. She continued that on the second part of the phrase, there is ‘Unum,’ the one, and if the country cannot find its way to the one, other people will come and find us. She reiterated that everyone in the room was fortunate to know they had a safe place to go home to that evening, but there are people in the world who would be happy to see that not happen. Thus, it is social responsibility to help other people understand one another, and the wrongs that have been done to each other’s communities. She shared that without doing so we as Americans will lose what we have, and the United States cannot be the best of itself. She also shared that her hope is that everyone on the Council continues to work together in these times.

**SECRETARY MAYORKAS:** “Thank you Rabbi.”

**MS. ROSICH** concluded the meeting.

*Meeting was adjourned at 4:15 PM.*

---

I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, the foregoing minutes are accurate and complete.

Signed and Dated,



8/15/24

Kiran Kaur Gill, Chairwoman, Faith-Based Security Advisory Council