



Transcript of **Public Meeting**

Thursday, October 17, 2024

Meeting of the Data Privacy and Integrity Advisory Committee

www.TP.One
800.FOR.DEPO (800.367.3376)
Scheduling@TP.One

Reference Number:146986

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY

MEETING OF THE
DATA PRIVACY AND INTEGRITY ADVISORY COMMITTEE

PUBLIC MEETING

Virtual Meeting

1:30 p.m.

Thursday, October 17, 2024

U.S. Department of Homeland Security
2701 Martin Luther King Jr. Ave. SE, Mail Stop 0655
Washington, DC 20598-0655

1	CONTENTS	
2	AGENDA ITEM	PAGE
3	CHAIRPERSON REMARKS	3
4	Lisa Sotto, Chairperson, Data Privacy and	
5	Integrity Advisory Committee,	
6	U.S. Department of Homeland Security	
7	CHIEF PRIVACY OFFICER INTRODUCTION AND 2024	
8	PRIORITIES	4
9	Deborah Fleischaker, Chief Privacy Officer	
10	(A), U.S. Department of Homeland Security	
11	QUESTIONS FROM COMMITTEE MEMBERS	12
12	PRIVACY @20 TASKING UPDATE	14
13	Chris Teitzel, Chair, Technology	14
14	Subcommittee, Data Privacy and Integrity	
15	Advisory Committee,	
16	U.S. Department of Homeland Security	
17		
18	Dennis Dayman, Chair, Policy Subcommittee,	16
19	Data Privacy and Integrity Advisory Committee,	
20	U.S. Department of Homeland Security	
21	PUBLIC LISTENING SESSION	20
22	CLOSING STATEMENTS AND MEETING ADJOURNMENT	31

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 Chairperson Remarks

3 Ms. Sotto: First of all, thank you,
4 Sandy, for the roll call and the kind introductions
5 of our new members.

6 Thank you all for joining us today. Good
7 afternoon. And welcome to this meeting of the Data
8 Privacy and Integrity Advisory Committee. Before
9 we jump in, I would like to thank you all very much
10 for joining us and for your interest in the work of
11 the DHS Privacy Office as well as the work of the
12 Committee.

13 A couple of reminders. If you could
14 please mute your mike and also turn off your
15 camera? Members of the public who wish to address
16 the Committee can do so during the listening
17 portion of the session. And we ask that you let us
18 know, please, by raising your hand or you can put
19 your comment in the chat. And we will make sure to
20 view that as well.

21 The purpose for today's meeting is to get
22 updates on the Privacy Office activities since our

1 last public meeting, which was last November. And
2 I would very much -- I am delighted to introduce
3 Deborah Fleischaker, who is currently serving as
4 the Acting Chief Privacy Officer. And Deb will
5 take a moment to introduce herself and discuss the
6 Privacy Office's priorities for 2024 and going
7 forward.

8 So, with that, I would like to turn it
9 over to Acting Chief Privacy Officer Deb
10 Fleischaker.

11 Ms. Fleischaker: Thank you, Lisa.

12 Chief Privacy Officer Introduction and
13 2024 Priorities

14 Ms. Fleischaker: Good afternoon,
15 everyone. I want to thank the Data Privacy and
16 Integrity Advisory Committee and interested members
17 of the public for joining us today for our public
18 meeting.

19 As you know, it's been quite a few months
20 since the last meeting. During that time, the
21 Privacy Office has been working hard. And we
22 appreciate that we can continue to turn to the

1 DPIAC for advice on confronting the Department's
2 privacy challenges.

3 As many of you may know, I was appointed
4 in August as Acting Deputy Chief Privacy Officer
5 and the Acting Chief FOIA Officer by Secretary
6 Mayorkas. While I am new to the Privacy Office, I
7 am not new to DHS. I have been here since 2011. I
8 have served as the Department's Executive
9 Secretariat and worked at the U.S. Immigration and
10 Customs Enforcement and the DHS Office for Civil
11 Rights and Civil Liberties over that time. In
12 addition, I spent a year on detail working on
13 Senator Lacey's staff working on various Judiciary
14 Committee issues, including immigration, national
15 security, and privacy.

16 I am so excited to be in the Privacy
17 Office and am honored to be able to work in an
18 office that promotes transparency, privacy, and the
19 protection of civil liberties and civil rights to
20 protect the public we serve.

21 First and foremost, my main goal for the
22 Privacy Office is to ensure it remains the premier

1 Privacy Office in the Federal Government. Since
2 stepping into the role, my focus has been on
3 ensuring that our Privacy Office efforts align with
4 our broader strategic plan, particularly in
5 advancing our commitment to data security,
6 transparency, and compliance.

7 Last year, the Privacy Office used DHS'
8 20th anniversary to reflect on the evolution of
9 threats facing the Nation and how its dedicated
10 workforce, the third largest in the Federal
11 Government, has evolved to meet them. As an
12 extension of this recognition and reflection,
13 former Chief Privacy Officer Clutter tasked the
14 DPIAC last year to assess the DHS Privacy Office
15 over the past 20 years to determine how best to
16 accomplish its mission over the next 20.

17 Before I review the Privacy Office's
18 priorities, I want to acknowledge the significant
19 work the DPIAC has already done on the Privacy @20
20 tasking. This project has made considerable
21 progress in assessing the Privacy Office's
22 authorities, resources, efficacy, and mission, and

1 advising on strategies for meeting the mission over
2 the next 20 years. I also want to ensure that
3 everyone understands our office remains fully
4 committed to the Privacy @20 tasking, even as I
5 come forward and take the acting role.

6 I would like to take a minute to review
7 some highlights of our 2023 to 2027 strategic plan.
8 The plan establishes a strong vision for the
9 Privacy Office. It will continue to serve as a
10 critical partner to our internal and external
11 stakeholders, securing the homeland and protecting
12 our values. The plan is a forward-leaning
13 blueprint for achieving the Privacy Office's
14 mission of promoting and protecting our shared
15 privacy and transparency values while safeguarding
16 the homeland.

17 I am particularly excited about how the
18 plan incorporates new and innovative thinking about
19 integrating privacy-enhancing technologies, or
20 PETs, into the Department's infrastructure. These
21 efforts are a fourth multiplier for our current
22 government structures and will significantly

1 benefit the public and the Department.

2 The plan also outlines a vision for
3 operating innovative customer-centric government
4 information disclosure program that provides timely
5 information to the public and stakeholders and
6 underlines the Privacy Office's commitment to
7 developing our workforce.

8 Finally, the plan includes our commitment
9 to continue to look for ways the Privacy Office can
10 leverage its resources and expertise to strengthen
11 privacy and disclosure across the Department.

12 Next I want to briefly recap some of the
13 great work in the privacy space over the past year.
14 The Privacy Office and our DHS Science and
15 Technology Directorate Silicon Valley Innovation
16 Project, SVIP, continue its work to collaborate on
17 privacy-enhancing technologies. For example, in
18 February, the Privacy Office, the Cybersecurity and
19 Infrastructure Security Agency, CISA; and the S&T
20 SVIP held an industry day event to promote our most
21 recent solicitation to facilitate the design and
22 development of a synthetic data generator, a type

1 of privacy-enhancing technology. This initiative
2 seeks to explore innovative technology to generate
3 data as needed and a scale that models and
4 replicates the shape and patterns of real data
5 while mitigating potential privacy, civil rights,
6 and civil liberties, and security harms. Such a
7 generator could be a gamechanger in the way the
8 Department uses data to train AI models, enhance
9 cyberthreat indicators, and test systems before
10 deployment while safeguarding sensitive personally
11 identifiable information.

12 Using SDG presents exciting
13 opportunities. It enables the Department to keep
14 innovating and developing new technologies that
15 rely on data while safeguarding privacy. And DHS
16 can more effectively collaborate with government,
17 industry, academia, and international partners
18 while continuing to protect privacy.

19 We continue to see the benefits of using
20 and embedding PETs into our systems. And it is now
21 a critical component of the Department's privacy
22 framework, providing components with smart advice

1 about what we can and should do. It has
2 established a privacy-respecting culture where
3 program operators see the value of privacy in their
4 mission. Tests will further place privacy at the
5 center to the Department's operations, building
6 trust, and enhancing transparency in all that we
7 do.

8 Privacy-enhancing technologies are just
9 one amazing tool in our toolbox for safeguarding
10 privacy, building trust with the communities we
11 serve, and enhancing transparency. Accordingly,
12 they are critical to the Department's privacy-
13 preserving mission.

14 Technology advances also are allowing us
15 to enable the responsible data (audio drop) by
16 design and security by design for a better future
17 that responsibly combines data from personal,
18 commercial, and/or government sources.

19 One last accomplishment I would like to
20 highlight is that we have updated and published the
21 Department-wide Privacy Compliance Artifact
22 Tracking System, PRIV-CATS 3.0, standard operating

1 procedures on the PRIV-CATS HelpHub page. The SOP
2 provides all component Privacy Offices with the
3 step-by-step process to successfully upload
4 compliance artifacts within PRIV-CATS, including
5 the 3.0 new features and enhancements since the
6 launch in May 2024. PRIV-CATS continues to serve
7 as a vital resource for collaboration, reporting
8 requirements, and meeting the mission-critical
9 needs of all new PRIV-CATS users.

10 As I wrap up, I want to thank each of you
11 for your thoughtful work on the Privacy @20
12 tasking. The expert perspectives and valuable
13 contributions of the DPIAC are essential to the
14 Department's mission of safeguarding privacy,
15 enhancing transparency, and protecting the
16 homeland.

17 I am looking forward to hearing the
18 insights and valuable feedback from members of the
19 public and stakeholders that will help inform the
20 Committee's recommendations. Please don't hesitate
21 to reach out to me with any thoughts or concerns.
22 I am excited about what we can achieve together and

1 look forward to building a stronger, more resilient
2 DHS Privacy Office. As we continue to work
3 together to create a supportive, energized, and
4 mission-driven environment, we can achieve great
5 things by uniting our efforts.

6 And, with that, I will now hand the floor
7 back over to Lisa.

8 Ms. Sotto: Thank you so much, Deb. And
9 we also are excited to work with you and just
10 delighted to do so and also very excited about the
11 continuation of this tasking --

12 Ms. Fleischaker: Yes.

13 Ms. Sotto: -- which I think is going to
14 be so important. Thank you very much.

15 So, with Deb's remarks having wrapped up,
16 does any member of the Committee have any questions
17 for Acting Chief Privacy Officer Fleischaker or
18 comments that you would like to make to her with
19 respect to the Privacy Office's activities and
20 updates as we just heard them?

21 Questions from Committee Members

22 Mr. Odutola: This is Ade Odutola.

1 Ms. Sotto: Go ahead. Sorry.

2 Mr. Odutola: No questions. Just to
3 welcome you. I look forward to working with you.
4 Welcome.

5 Ms. Fleischaker: Thank you. Thank you
6 so much.

7 Mr. Odutola: You're very welcome.

8 Ms. Fleischaker: And to the extent folks
9 want to reach out and talk with me privately, I'm
10 certainly happy to have that happen as well.

11 Ms. Sotto: We have another 10 seconds.
12 Any other comments, questions?

13 [No response.]

14 Ms. Sotto: Okay. I just have to say I
15 think putting tasks front and center is just so key
16 and very much in keeping with the sort of global
17 tenor of others worldwide who are thinking hard
18 about tasks and about the use of synthetic data, so
19 terrific update. Thank you very much. All right.

20 So now I will turn the program over to
21 our Policy and Technology Subcommittee chairs,
22 Dennis Dayman and Chris Teitzel, for updates on the

1 Privacy @20 tasking. I want to say before I turn
2 over the podium to them they have been unbelievable
3 in moving this tasking forward, energizing the
4 group, interviewing loads of folks, reading a ton
5 of background material. And I just am truly,
6 truly, and deeply appreciative to both Dennis and
7 Chris and the members of their committees for
8 moving us forward.

9 So please take it away.

10 Mr. Dayman: Chris, go ahead, please.

11 Mr. Teitzel: Sure thing. Thank you,
12 Lisa.

13 Privacy @20 Tasking Update

14 Mr. Teitzel: And yes, I think I can
15 speak on behalf of Dennis as well to say that this
16 tasking has been one that we have really dug into
17 and are starting to see some very fruitful outcomes
18 from it.

19 So we're still in the I would say end
20 phases of the research and in drafting phase of the
21 final report, but as part of what we have been
22 doing, we have been conducting a number of

1 interviews with folks, both past and present
2 members of the Privacy Office. They all have
3 glowing things to say about the Privacy Office.
4 And, Deb, like you had mentioned, it is the beacon
5 for many in the government around what a privacy
6 office can and should be doing.

7 We have also talked with a number of
8 professionals in the private space to gain
9 information on what they see as challenges for
10 their privacy offices as well as if they can
11 provide any context to what the DHS Privacy Office
12 may be running into as well in the future. And
13 from those interviews and discussions, we have been
14 working on a number of areas and technologies to
15 highlight in our report, such as AI, which is
16 always the main topic on folks' mind, but, in
17 addition to that, is around data integrity, the
18 integrity in the validity of datasets that are
19 going into models and trainings, privacy-enhancing
20 technologies. And the report will highlight all of
21 that as well as offer more insight into important
22 areas where the Privacy Office is likely going to

1 be expanding as it continues to need to cover and
2 grow to meet the scope of these technologies and
3 policies that are continuing to grow.

4 So we have no definitive conclusion yet
5 on how the recommendations will come out. And part
6 of that is we want to have this listening session
7 that we are going to be having today and hear from
8 folks from the general public on what their
9 thoughts and ideas are for the future of the
10 Privacy Office.

11 But the teams are working to bring
12 together the report. And we should have a full
13 meeting of the DPIAC ready in the near future to
14 have a discussion and adoption of that report. And
15 I for one am greatly thankful for all of those that
16 are getting involved in working in this report.

17 So, with that, Dennis, I will turn it
18 over to you if you have any further details.

19 Mr. Dayman: No. Thank you, Chris. I
20 think that was a great summary so far of this
21 thing.

22 As everyone has said here, this has been

1 a fantastic tasking and a very interesting one for
2 us I think as we look at in the years past and
3 then, obviously, looking at the years forward. You
4 know, looking at the years past for some of us who
5 have not been here for as long, it has been
6 interesting to be able to talk to other individuals
7 who are currently on the Committee today who have
8 worked for DHS to hear sort of the early
9 beginnings, the humble beginnings, of this office,
10 you know, where it needed to be, where it wanted to
11 go, and how it has continued to look at itself and
12 to learn how to improve itself to serve not only
13 DHS but also the community as well.

14 And, as Chris said, right, this has been
15 a fantastic tasking for us as we kind of go back
16 and forth several different times on different
17 ideas, different thought process. Even as we look
18 at new technologies today, what does that mean for
19 the office in those technologies? You know, in
20 previous taskings, technology has always been a
21 forefront discussion point, right, about whether or
22 not -- you know, social media, as an example, how

1 it can or should be used by departments under DHS.
2 And we are looking at those sorts of things today
3 when it comes to things like AI and understanding
4 the transparency and the public trust that comes
5 with the proper use of these technologies, what the
6 organizational structure potentially should look
7 like moving forward as well. As Chris had
8 mentioned, you know, the role of the modern chief
9 privacy officer, chief privacy officer, how it is
10 serving this organization, whether it is a public
11 or a private entity, will play into a lot of our
12 findings. Again, the monitoring of emerging
13 threats and regulatory changes is also playing into
14 our discussions on a daily basis as well.

15 So our key recommendations, as Chris has
16 said, are still being worked on. And we are very
17 excited about the things that we are hearing. We
18 are very excited to hear about our members on these
19 committees that have very strong opinions in some
20 areas, in other areas not so many strong opinions.
21 But it is interesting to see the back-and-forthness
22 of our committees because our committees, again,

1 are developed of different people with different
2 numbering of years of experience, different
3 vertical spaces as well. And all of that is
4 playing into a very, very well-rounded discussion
5 and hopefully creating the report that DHS and our
6 Chief Privacy Officer at DHS will also need as
7 well.

8 So that is what I would probably add to
9 that, Chris, but thank you very much for your
10 comments there.

11 Mr. Teitzel: And, with that, Lisa, we
12 will turn it back over to you.

13 Ms. Sotto: All right. Well, again, deep
14 appreciation for all you are doing.

15 I think you can see from Dennis' and
16 Chris' comments that the Committee has been working
17 very hard in conducting the assessments of the
18 Privacy Office and considering recommendations on
19 how DHS can continue to safeguard privacy,
20 understanding that there are -- you know, we have
21 to, of course, absorb the rapid advances in
22 technology and the significant changes in the way

1 data is used and relied upon by the Department.

2 So does any member of the Committee have
3 questions for Dennis or Chris at this time on the
4 tasking, members of the Committee? Please just
5 jump in. Don't be shy. If you have a question,
6 you don't need to raise your hand. Just jump right
7 in.

8 [No response.]

9 Ms. Sotto: I think everything seems to
10 be going swimmingly, guys. No comments. There's
11 been, obviously, a lot of discussion behind the
12 scenes. So this does not mean things have been
13 actually quiet. It's they are just quiet on this
14 call. All right.

15 Well, let's, then, jump right into our
16 listening session. And we would ask, please, that
17 you keep your remarks under three minutes, as
18 described in the Federal Register notice. If you
19 are joining by phone, you can mute and unmute
20 yourself by pressing *6.

21 And I will just remind you that the
22 purpose of this listening session is to allow us to

1 better understand your insights, your concerns,
2 your ideas on this tasking. It is important, just
3 as you have heard a number of times now, that we
4 work together to address all viewpoints. And this
5 session will help us do just that.

6 [No response.]

7 Public Listening Session

8 Ms. Sotto: All right. So these are the
9 questions that were posted in the Federal Register
10 for public consideration in response to the task
11 here.

12 So, again, if you would like to address
13 the Committee, please do. This is your time to do
14 it. All right. I see one raised hand: AK.
15 Abigail, please go ahead.

16 Ms. Kunkler: Hi. Good afternoon,
17 Chairperson Sotto and members of the Committee. My
18 name is Abigail Kunkler, and I am here on behalf of
19 the Electronic Privacy Information Center, a public
20 interest research center that works to secure the
21 right to privacy for everyone. I would like to
22 thank you for the opportunity to speak today.

1 Now, the Committee has been tasked, as
2 you know, with conducting an assessment of the
3 Privacy Office's authorities, resources, efficacy,
4 and mission and, more specifically, to assess the
5 use of the fair information practice principles.
6 As the Committee conducts this assessment, EPIC
7 urges it to focus on DHS' use of facial recognition
8 technology, commercial data, and the artificial
9 intelligence to understand the shortcomings of DHS
10 privacy in the current oversight framework. Facial
11 recognition technology is often unreliable and can
12 lead to wrongful arrest, incarceration, or
13 deportation. Even accurate systems are dangerous
14 and can chill democratic participation.

15 Despite the dangers of facial recognition
16 and the lack of Federal regulation, DHS has broadly
17 implemented the use of the technology. And the
18 agency has often done so without a Privacy Impact
19 Assessment prior to implementation. Indeed, DHS
20 was widely using the controversial Clearview AI
21 service before DHS Privacy even knew. And the
22 agency only conducted an assessment after

1 widespread news coverage.

2 The story only gets worse when we look at
3 DHS' use of commercial data. Data brokers collect
4 and settle but fail to verify unimaginable amounts
5 of data, including data that would require a
6 warrant for DHS to collect directly. DHS often
7 purchases this data and in doing so is conducting
8 warrantless surveillance on Americans based on
9 unverified information. A DHS Inspector General
10 report on DHS' use of telegraphy data detailed its
11 disregard for adhering to agency privacy policies,
12 including conducting a PIA.

13 DHS' use of facial recognition and
14 commercial data highlight a pattern of the agency's
15 disregard for the current oversight framework.
16 Additionally, when DHS does conduct required PIAs,
17 it is not only done after the fact as a box-
18 checking exercise but lacks a meaningful assessment
19 of the privacy risks of the technology at issue.
20 This flies in the face of the fair information
21 practice principles. These issues will only be
22 exacerbated by the increasing use of AI because of

1 its indiscriminate data use and inherent security
2 vulnerabilities that make it unreliable, even as it
3 makes high-stakes decisions that impact lives.

4 As part of your work addressing these and
5 other privacy issues, EPIC recommends that this
6 Committee assess DHS' compliance with existing
7 oversight mechanisms, including PIAs as well as
8 data-mining reports. This assessment should
9 consider the implementation of these mechanisms and
10 their efficacy in light of the new technologies and
11 ask whether DHS provides sufficient detail and
12 adequately evaluates the risks of third party
13 technology and data. Such an assessment is
14 necessary to protect Americans' privacy.

15 Thank you for your time.

16 Ms. Sotto: Thank you so much. We very
17 much appreciate your remarks.

18 And I would ask for others. Any other
19 comments? Let's give it a few minutes.

20 [No response.]

21 Ms. Sotto: Sandy, I am not missing any,
22 am I?

1 Ms. Taylor: Hey, Lisa. No, you are not
2 missing any.

3 Ms. Sotto: Okay.

4 Ms. Taylor: Do we have any members of
5 the public, any DHS employees who would like to
6 chime in at this time?

7 Mr. Scott: Could I chime in? This is
8 Jeramie Scott from EPIC.

9 Ms. Taylor: Absolutely.

10 Mr. Scott: I know my colleague Abigail
11 just spoke, but I just kind of want to emphasize
12 some of the points she just made.

13 We have looked into, "we" being the EPIC,
14 the Electronic Privacy Information Center, into,
15 DHS' various oversight mechanisms, and particularly
16 Privacy Impact Assessment as well as the data-
17 mining reports that are required. And not only
18 does it come across as very much a box-checking
19 exercise, as mentioned by Abigail. Oftentimes
20 there is not only failure to do it but a complete
21 disregard for the PIAs. So there is really a need
22 for an overarching review of how the oversight

1 mechanisms are being implemented, if they are being
2 implemented in an effective way. Oftentimes what
3 we see is not until there is kind of public or
4 publicity news coverage around certain technologies
5 does DHS actually start moving with the required
6 Privacy Impact Assessments, privacy threshold
7 analysis, et cetera, other kind of privacy
8 requirements related to the use of technology that
9 involves EII.

10 And so I would really hope that this
11 Committee takes a hard look at that and looks at
12 the examples raised, namely the use of facial
13 recognition, the use of commercial data, and
14 already, you know, with the use of AI as well.

15 And I will just say that EPIC is happy to
16 provide our expertise as we have looked at a lot of
17 these things over the years and will continue to do
18 so. So anything we can help with respect to the
19 Committee's look and assessment of these things, we
20 are happy to do so.

21 And thank you for the time to speak.

22 Ms. Sotto: Thank you so much, very

1 helpful comments I know we are absorbing. Thank
2 you. Good.

3 We will give it another few minutes.

4 Others?

5 [No response.]

6 Ms. Sotto: All right. Sandy, should we
7 go ahead and wrap up?

8 Ms. Taylor: Lisa, we just got something
9 in the chat. Let me see.

10 Ms. Sotto: Great.

11 Ms. Taylor: So Kate Claffie, who is
12 privacy officer at U.S. Coast Guard, said, "As part
13 of the review, is there also a look/review of where
14 components have the placement of the component
15 privacy officers in their organization? For
16 example, is a component privacy officer's reporting
17 chain reporting to the head of the component or are
18 they further down in the organization? Is that
19 something that the Committee is looking into as
20 well: the placement of privacy officers at the
21 component?"

22 Ms. Sotto: Chris or Dennis, do you want

1 to take that one?

2 Mr. Teitzel: Sure. We actually have had
3 conversations with component privacy officers
4 regarding this exact topic of what is the reporting
5 chain, who do they report to, and how does that
6 reporting get up to the privacy office and get the
7 privacy office involved? So the short answer is
8 yes, we have had these conversations, more than
9 happy to continue to have those conversations and
10 gain insights from various component privacy
11 officers on what they see in their day-to-day
12 operations. But yes, this is definitely something
13 that the Committee had looked into and will be part
14 of the report.

15 Mr. Dayman: Yes. I would echo Chris'
16 comments. As I had sort of mentioned earlier, not
17 only looking at the current components of the
18 different privacy offices, again, looking back at
19 other individuals, including a Committee member
20 that is on the Policy Subcommittee right now, who
21 has had experience not as the privacy officer but
22 has had experience working on the early stages of

1 the Privacy Office for DHS, and then talking to
2 other privacy officers who have moved on to other
3 positions within DHS or other parts of the
4 government. We have definitely been working with
5 them to sort of understand, again, the historical
6 thoughts that they have had and, then, you know,
7 over the years, the experiences or knowledge that
8 they have gained now moving forward, what they
9 think that the office should be looking at moving
10 forward.

11 Mr. Teitzel: I think one thing that kind
12 of tied back into that, folks that we have talked
13 to that are, you know, office alumni, if you will,
14 have had nothing but glowing remarks to say as they
15 went on in their privacy career into other
16 organizations, whether it is other departments.
17 Some moved into DOD. They all refer back to their
18 time in the office as foundationary to what they
19 are doing now. And they are continuing to look
20 towards the office to take those practices into
21 their current roles.

22 So, again, working with the leadership

1 here and just kind of in my part going back over
2 the last 20 years, it has been fascinating to watch
3 how an office that had at its beginning, at its
4 core just a few members has grown into one of the
5 more premier privacy offices within the government.

6 Ms. Sotto: Thank you for raising that, a
7 good and important question.

8 Others? And please either just chime in
9 or send a chat.

10 [No response.]

11 Ms. Sotto: Sandy, should we go ahead and
12 wrap up?

13 Ms. Taylor: I think so, Lisa. We are
14 not seeing any movement from anywhere, any
15 questions, any raised hands. So yes, absolutely.

16 Oh, Chris? Go ahead, Chris.

17 Mr. Teitzel: Yes. I was just going to
18 say understanding with a lot of people on the call
19 and in the comments, I would say if there are
20 further comments that folks would like to say or
21 provide us, you know, I think they can contact the
22 Privacy Office with that. And we can have that

1 make its way towards the committees that are
2 working on the tasking, so just an open call of if
3 you look at these questions here for public
4 consideration and you have further thoughts on it
5 or you want to provide further thoughts, please do
6 contact the Privacy Office with those responses or
7 questions. We would be happy to include those in
8 our discussions on the reporting.

9 Ms. Sotto: All right. Thank you.

10 Anything else? I don't want to close out
11 this discussion if anybody else has anything that
12 they would like to add.

13 [No response.]

14 Ms. Sotto: All right. Well, I think
15 this, then, concludes our listening session
16 portion.

17 Closing Statements and Meeting Adjournment

18 Ms. Sotto: If you would like to submit
19 written comments, you can absolutely do so. If you
20 could email them to privacycommittee@hq.dhs.gov? I
21 am going to repeat it:
22 privacycommittee@hq.dhs.gov. And if you could do

1 so by November 7, we would very much appreciate
2 that.

3 And, also, please note that because the
4 DPIAC operates under the provisions of the Federal
5 Advisory Committee Act, all written comments will
6 be treated as public documents, and they will be
7 available for public inspection.

8 With that, many thanks to Acting Chief
9 Privacy Officer Deborah Fleischaker, to Committee
10 members, and to members of the public for
11 participating in today's meeting.

12 This concludes today's session. We are
13 grateful for your interest, really grateful, and
14 appreciate all of the comments. And we encourage
15 you also to follow the Committee's work by checking
16 our webpage. The minutes of today's meeting will
17 be posted there in the near future.

18 And, with that, the meeting is adjourned.
19 Thank you all.

20 (Whereupon, at 2:08 p.m., the meeting was
21 adjourned.)

22

CERTIFICATE OF TRANSCRIBER

I, Sarah Veach, do hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge and belief, the attached transcript is a true and accurate transcription of the indicated audio recording.

I further certify that I am neither attorney nor counsel for nor related nor employed by any of the parties to the action; further, that I am not a relative or employee of any attorney or counsel employed by the parties hereto or financially invested in this action.

10/29/2024

DATE

Sarah Veach

10/29/2024
10:58 AM
10/29/2024
10:58 AM

800.367.3376

WORD INDEX

< 0 >

0655 1:19

< 1 >

1:30 1:11**10** 13:11**12** 2:11**14** 2:12, 13**16** 2:18**17** 1:12

< 2 >

2:08 32:20**20** 2:12, 21

6:15, 16, 19 7:2,

4 11:11 14:1,

13 30:2

2011 5:7**2023** 7:7**2024** 1:12 2:7

4:6, 13 11:6

2027 7:7**20598-0655** 1:20**20th** 6:8**2701** 1:19

< 3 >

3 2:3**3.0** 10:22 11:5**31** 2:22

< 4 >

4 2:8

< 6 >

6 20:20

< 7 >

7 32:1

< A >

Abigail 21:15,
18 25:10, 19**able** 5:17 17:6**Absolutely** 25:9

30:15 31:19

absorb 19:21**absorbing** 27:1**academia** 9:17**accomplish** 6:16**accomplishment**

10:19

accurate 22:13**achieve** 11:22

12:4

achieving 7:13**acknowledge**

6:18

Act 32:5**Acting** 4:4, 9

5:4, 5 7:5

12:17 32:8

activities 3:22

12:19

add 19:8 31:12**addition** 5:12

15:17

Additionally

23:16

address 3:15

21:4, 12

addressing 24:4**Ade** 12:22**adequately**

24:12

adhering 23:11**adjourned**

32:18, 21

ADJOURNMENT**T** 2:22 31:17**adoption** 16:14**advances** 10:14

19:21

advancing 6:5**advice** 5:1 9:22**advising** 7:1**ADVISORY** 1:4

2:5, 15, 19 3:8

4:16 32:5

afternoon 3:7

4:14 21:16

Agency 8:19

22:18, 22 23:11,

14

AGENDA 2:2**ahead** 13:1

14:10 21:15

27:7 30:11, 16

AI 9:8 15:15

18:3 22:20

23:22 26:14

AK 21:14**align** 6:3**allow** 20:22**allowing** 10:14**alumni** 29:13**amazing** 10:9**Americans** 23:8

24:14

amounts 23:4**analysis** 26:7**and/or** 10:18**anniversary** 6:8**answer** 28:7**anybody** 31:11**appointed** 5:3**appreciate** 4:22

24:17 32:1, 14

appreciation

19:14

appreciative

14:6

areas 15:14, 22

18:20

arrest 22:12**Artifact** 10:21**artifacts** 11:4**artificial** 22:8**assess** 6:14

22:4 24:6

assessing 6:21**assessment** 22:2,

6, 19, 22 23:18

24:8, 13 25:16

26:19

assessments

19:17 26:6

audio 10:15**August** 5:4**authorities** 6:22

22:3

available 32:7**Ave** 1:19

< B >

back 12:7

17:15 19:12

28:18 29:12, 17

30:1

back-and-**forthness** 18:21**background**

14:5

based 23:8**basis** 18:14**beacon** 15:4**beginning** 30:3**beginnings** 17:9

behalf 14:15 21:18	chat 3:19 27:9 30:9	20:10 24:19 27:1 28:16	conclusion 16:4
benefit 8:1	checking 23:18 32:15	30:19, 20 31:19 32:5, 14	conduct 23:16
benefits 9:19	CHIEF 2:7, 9 4:4, 9, 12 5:4, 5 6:13 12:17 18:8, 9 19:6 32:8	commercial 10:18 22:8 23:3, 14 26:13	conducted 22:22
best 6:15	chill 22:14	committed 7:4	conducting 14:22 19:17 22:2 23:7, 12
better 10:16 21:1	chime 25:6, 7 30:8	COMMITTEE 1:4 2:5, 11, 15, 19 3:8, 12, 16 4:16 5:14 11:20 12:16, 21 17:7 19:16 20:2, 4 21:13, 17 22:1, 6 24:6 26:11, 19 27:19 28:13, 19 32:5, 9, 15	conducts 22:6
blueprint 7:13	Chris 2:13 13:22 14:7, 10 16:19 17:14 18:7, 15 19:9, 16 20:3 27:22 28:15 30:16	commitment 6:5 8:6, 8	confronting 5:1
box 23:17	CISA 8:19	COMMITTED 7:4	consider 24:9
box-checking 25:18	Civil 5:10, 11, 19 9:5, 6	COMMITTEE 1:4 2:5, 11, 15, 19 3:8, 12, 16 4:16 5:14 11:20 12:16, 21 17:7 19:16 20:2, 4 21:13, 17 22:1, 6 24:6 26:11, 19 27:19 28:13, 19 32:5, 9, 15	considerable 6:20
briefly 8:12	Claffie 27:11	committees 14:7 18:19, 22 31:1	consideration 21:10 31:4
bring 16:11	Clearview 22:20	communities 10:10	considering 19:18
broader 6:4	close 31:10	community 17:13	contact 30:21 31:6
broadly 22:16	CLOSING 2:22 31:17	complete 25:20	CONTACTS 2:1
brokers 23:3	Clutter 6:13	compliance 6:6 10:21 11:4 24:6	context 15:11
building 10:5, 10 12:1	Coast 27:12	component 9:21 11:2 27:14, 16, 17, 21 28:3, 10	continuation 12:11
< C >	collaborate 8:16 9:16	components 9:22 27:14 28:17	continue 4:22 7:9 8:9, 16 9:19 12:2 19:19 26:17 28:9
call 3:4 20:14 30:18 31:2	collaboration 11:7	concerns 11:21 21:1	CONTEXTS 2:1
camera 3:15	colleague 25:10	concludes 31:15 32:12	context 15:11
career 29:15	collect 23:3, 6		continuation 12:11
center 10:5 13:15 21:19, 20 25:14	combines 10:17		continue 4:22 7:9 8:9, 16 9:19 12:2 19:19 26:17 28:9
certain 26:4	come 7:5 16:5 25:18		continued 17:11
certainly 13:10	comes 18:3, 4		continues 11:6 16:1
cetera 26:7	comment 3:19		continuing 9:18 16:3 29:19
chain 27:17 28:5	comments 12:18 13:12 19:10, 16		contributions 11:13
Chair 2:13, 18			controversial 22:20
CHAIRPERSON 2:3, 4 3:2 21:17			conversations 28:3, 8, 9
chairs 13:21			core 30:4
challenges 5:2 15:9			couple 3:13
changes 18:13 19:22			course 19:21
			cover 16:1

<p>coverage 23:1 26:4</p> <p>create 12:3</p> <p>creating 19:5</p> <p>critical 7:10 9:21 10:12</p> <p>culture 10:2</p> <p>current 7:21 22:10 23:15 28:17 29:21</p> <p>currently 4:3 17:7</p> <p>customer-centric 8:3</p> <p>Customs 5:10</p> <p>Cybersecurity 8:18</p> <p>cyberthreat 9:9</p> <p>< D ></p> <p>daily 18:14</p> <p>dangerous 22:13</p> <p>dangers 22:15</p> <p>DATA 1:4 2:4, 14, 19 3:7 4:15 6:5 8:22 9:3, 4, 8, 15 10:17 13:18 15:17 20:1 22:8 23:3, 5, 7, 10, 14 24:1, 13 25:16 26:13</p> <p>data-mining 24:8</p> <p>datasets 15:18</p> <p>date 10:15</p> <p>day 8:20</p> <p>Dayman 2:18 13:22 14:10 16:19 28:15</p> <p>day-to-day</p>	<p>28:11</p> <p>DC 1:20</p> <p>Deb 4:4, 9 12:8, 15 15:4</p> <p>Deborah 2:9 4:3 32:9</p> <p>decisions 24:3</p> <p>dedicated 6:9</p> <p>deep 19:13</p> <p>deeply 14:6</p> <p>definitely 28:12 29:4</p> <p>definitive 16:4</p> <p>delighted 4:2 12:10</p> <p>democratic 22:14</p> <p>Dennis 2:18 13:22 14:6, 15 16:17 19:15 20:3 27:22</p> <p>DEPARTMENT 1:1, 18 2:6, 10, 16, 20 5:1, 8 7:20 8:1, 11 9:8, 13, 21 10:5, 12 11:14 20:1</p> <p>departments 18:1 29:16</p> <p>Department- wide 10:21</p> <p>deployment 9:10</p> <p>deportation 22:13</p> <p>Deputy 5:4</p> <p>described 20:18</p> <p>design 8:21 10:16</p> <p>Despite 22:15</p> <p>detail 5:12</p>	<p>24:11</p> <p>detailed 23:10</p> <p>details 16:18</p> <p>determine 6:15</p> <p>developed 19:1</p> <p>developing 8:7 9:14</p> <p>development 8:22</p> <p>DHS 3:11 5:7, 10 6:7, 14 8:14 9:15 12:2 15:11 17:8, 13 18:1 19:5, 6, 19 22:7, 9, 16, 19, 21 23:3, 6, 9, 10, 13, 16 24:6, 11 25:5, 15 26:5 29:1, 3</p> <p>different 17:16, 17 19:1, 2 28:18</p> <p>directly 23:6</p> <p>Directorate 8:15</p> <p>disclosure 8:4, 11</p> <p>discuss 4:5</p> <p>discussion 16:14 17:21 19:4 20:11 31:11</p> <p>discussions 15:13 18:14 31:8</p> <p>disregard 23:11, 15 25:21</p> <p>documents 32:6</p> <p>DOD 29:17</p> <p>doing 14:22 15:6 19:14 23:7 29:19</p> <p>don 11:20 20:5, 6 31:10</p>	<p>DPIAC 5:1 6:14, 19 11:13 16:13 32:4</p> <p>drafting 14:20</p> <p>drop 10:15</p> <p>dug 14:16</p> <p>< E ></p> <p>earlier 28:16</p> <p>early 17:8 28:22</p> <p>echo 28:15</p> <p>effective 26:2</p> <p>effectively 9:16</p> <p>efficacy 6:22 22:3 24:10</p> <p>efforts 6:3 7:21 12:5</p> <p>EII 26:9</p> <p>either 30:8</p> <p>Electronic 21:19 25:14</p> <p>email 31:20</p> <p>embedding 9:20</p> <p>emerging 18:12</p> <p>emphasize 25:11</p> <p>employees 25:5</p> <p>enable 10:15</p> <p>enables 9:13</p> <p>encourage 32:14</p> <p>energized 12:3</p> <p>energizing 14:3</p> <p>Enforcement 5:10</p> <p>enhance 9:8</p> <p>enhancements 11:5</p> <p>enhancing 10:6, 11 11:15</p> <p>ensure 5:22 7:2</p>
--	--	--	---

<p>ensuring 6:3 entity 18:11 environment 12:4 EPIC 22:6 24:5 25:8, 13 26:15 essential 11:13 established 10:2 establishes 7:8 et 26:7 evaluates 24:12 event 8:20 evolution 6:8 evolved 6:11 exacerbated 23:22 exact 28:4 example 8:17 17:22 27:16 examples 26:12 excited 5:16 7:17 11:22 12:9, 10 18:17, 18 exciting 9:12 Executive 5:8 exercise 23:18 25:19 existing 24:6 expanding 16:1 experience 19:2 28:21, 22 experiences 29:7 expert 11:12 expertise 8:10 26:16 explore 9:2 extension 6:12 extent 13:8</p>	<p>external 7:10 < F > face 23:20 facial 22:7, 10, 15 23:13 26:12 facilitate 8:21 facing 6:9 fact 23:17 fail 23:4 failure 25:20 fair 22:5 23:20 fantastic 17:1, 15 far 16:20 fascinating 30:2 features 11:5 February 8:18 Federal 6:1, 10 20:18 21:9 22:16 32:4 feedback 11:18 final 14:21 Finally 8:8 findings 18:12 First 3:3 5:21 Fleischaker 2:9 4:3, 10, 11, 14 12:12, 17 13:5, 8 32:9 flies 23:20 floor 12:6 focus 6:2 22:7 FOIA 5:5 folks 13:8 14:4 15:1, 16 16:8 29:12 30:20 follow 32:15 forefront 17:21 foremost 5:21</p>	<p>former 6:13 forth 17:16 forward 4:7 7:5 11:17 12:1 13:3 14:3, 8 17:3 18:7 29:8, 10 forward-leaning 7:12 foundatory 29:18 fourth 7:21 framework 9:22 22:10 23:15 front 13:15 fruitful 14:17 full 16:12 fully 7:3 further 10:4 16:18 27:18 30:20 31:4, 5 future 10:16 15:12 16:9, 13 32:17 < G > gain 15:8 28:10 gained 29:8 gamechanger 9:7 general 16:8 23:9 generate 9:2 generator 8:22 9:7 getting 16:16 give 24:19 27:3 global 13:16 glowing 15:3 29:14</p>	<p>Go 13:1 14:10 17:11, 15 21:15 27:7 30:11, 16 goal 5:21 going 4:6 12:13 15:19, 22 16:7 20:10 30:1, 17 31:21 Good 3:6 4:14 21:16 27:2 30:7 Government 6:1, 11 7:22 8:3 9:16 10:18 15:5 29:4 30:5 grateful 32:13 great 8:13 12:4 16:20 27:10 greatly 16:15 group 14:4 grow 16:2, 3 grown 30:4 Guard 27:12 guys 20:10 < H > hand 3:18 12:6 20:6 21:14 hands 30:15 happen 13:10 happy 13:10 26:15, 20 28:9 31:7 hard 4:21 13:17 19:17 26:11 harms 9:6 head 27:17 hear 16:7 17:8 18:18 heard 12:20 21:3</p>
--	--	--	---

<p>hearing 11:17 18:17</p> <p>held 8:20</p> <p>help 11:19 21:5 26:18</p> <p>helpful 27:1</p> <p>HelpHub 11:1</p> <p>hesitate 11:20</p> <p>Hey 25:1</p> <p>Hi 21:16</p> <p>highlight 10:20 15:15, 20 23:14</p> <p>highlights 7:7</p> <p>high-stakes 24:3</p> <p>historical 29:5</p> <p>HOMELAND 1:1, 18 2:6, 10, 16, 20 7:11, 16 11:16</p> <p>honored 5:17</p> <p>hope 26:10</p> <p>hopefully 19:5</p> <p>humble 17:9</p> <p>< I ></p> <p>ideas 16:9 17:17 21:2</p> <p>identifiable 9:11</p> <p>Immigration 5:9, 14</p> <p>Impact 22:18 24:3 25:16 26:6</p> <p>implementation 22:19 24:9</p> <p>implemented 22:17 26:1, 2</p> <p>important 12:14 15:21 21:2 30:7</p> <p>improve 17:12</p> <p>incarceration</p>	<p>22:12</p> <p>include 31:7</p> <p>includes 8:8</p> <p>including 5:14 11:4 23:5, 12 24:7 28:19</p> <p>incorporates 7:18</p> <p>increasing 23:22</p> <p>indicators 9:9</p> <p>indiscriminate 24:1</p> <p>individuals 17:6 28:19</p> <p>industry 8:20 9:17</p> <p>inform 11:19</p> <p>information 8:4, 5 9:11 15:9 21:19 22:5 23:9, 20 25:14</p> <p>infrastructure 7:20 8:19</p> <p>inherent 24:1</p> <p>initiative 9:1</p> <p>innovating 9:14</p> <p>Innovation 8:15</p> <p>innovative 7:18 8:3 9:2</p> <p>insight 15:21</p> <p>insights 11:18 21:1 28:10</p> <p>inspection 32:7</p> <p>Inspector 23:9</p> <p>integrating 7:19</p> <p>INTEGRITY 1:4 2:5, 14, 19 3:8 4:16 15:17, 18</p> <p>intelligence 22:9</p>	<p>interest 3:10 21:20 32:13</p> <p>interested 4:16</p> <p>interesting 17:1, 6 18:21</p> <p>internal 7:10</p> <p>international 9:17</p> <p>interviewing 14:4</p> <p>interviews 15:1, 13</p> <p>introduce 4:2, 5</p> <p>INTRODUCTIO N 2:7 4:12</p> <p>introductions 3:4</p> <p>involved 16:16 28:7</p> <p>involves 26:9</p> <p>issue 23:19</p> <p>issues 5:14 23:21 24:5</p> <p>ITEM 2:2</p> <p>its 6:9, 16 8:10, 16 23:10 24:1 30:3 31:1</p> <p>< J ></p> <p>Jeramie 25:8</p> <p>joining 3:6, 10 4:17 20:19</p> <p>Jr 1:19</p> <p>Judiciary 5:13</p> <p>jump 3:9 20:5, 6, 15</p> <p>< K ></p> <p>Kate 27:11</p> <p>keep 9:13 20:17</p>	<p>keeping 13:16</p> <p>key 13:15 18:15</p> <p>kind 3:4 17:15 25:11 26:3, 7 29:11 30:1</p> <p>King 1:19</p> <p>knew 22:21</p> <p>know 3:18 4:19 5:3 17:4, 10, 19, 22 18:8 19:20 22:2 25:10 26:14 27:1 29:6, 13 30:21</p> <p>knowledge 29:7</p> <p>Kunkler 21:16, 18</p> <p>< L ></p> <p>Lacey 5:13</p> <p>lack 22:16</p> <p>lacks 23:18</p> <p>largest 6:10</p> <p>launch 11:6</p> <p>lead 22:12</p> <p>leadership 29:22</p> <p>learn 17:12</p> <p>leverage 8:10</p> <p>Liberties 5:11, 19 9:6</p> <p>light 24:10</p> <p>Lisa 2:4 4:11 12:7 14:12 19:11 25:1 27:8 30:13</p> <p>LISTENING 2:21 3:16 16:6 20:16, 22 21:7 31:15</p> <p>lives 24:3</p>
---	---	---	--

<p>loads 14:4 long 17:5 look 8:9 12:1 13:3 17:2, 11, 17 18:6 23:2 26:11, 19 29:19 31:3 look/review 27:13 looked 25:13 26:16 28:13 looking 11:17 17:3, 4 18:2 27:19 28:17, 18 29:9 looks 26:11 lot 18:11 20:11 26:16 30:18 Luther 1:19</p> <p>< M > Mail 1:19 main 5:21 15:16 Martin 1:19 material 14:5 Mayorkas 5:6 mean 17:18 20:12 meaningful 23:18 mechanisms 24:7, 9 25:15 26:1 media 17:22 meet 6:11 16:2 MEETING 1:3, 6, 10 2:22 3:7, 21 4:1, 18, 20 7:1 11:8 16:13</p>	<p>31:17 32:11, 16, 18, 20 member 12:16 20:2 28:19 MEMBERS 2:11 3:5, 15 4:16 11:18 12:21 14:7 15:2 18:18 20:4 21:17 25:4 30:4 32:10 mentioned 15:4 18:8 25:19 28:16 mike 3:14 mind 15:16 mining 25:17 minute 7:6 minutes 20:17 24:19 27:3 32:16 missing 24:21 25:2 mission 6:16, 22 7:1, 14 10:4, 13 11:14 22:4 mission-critical 11:8 mission-driven 12:4 mitigating 9:5 models 9:3, 8 15:19 modern 18:8 moment 4:5 monitoring 18:12 months 4:19 moved 29:2, 17 movement 30:14</p>	<p>moving 14:3, 8 18:7 26:5 29:8, 9 multiplier 7:21 mute 3:14 20:19</p> <p>< N > name 21:18 Nation 6:9 national 5:14 near 16:13 32:17 necessary 24:14 need 16:1 19:6 20:6 25:21 needed 9:3 17:10 needs 11:9 new 3:5 5:6, 7 7:18 9:14 11:5, 9 17:18 24:10 news 23:1 26:4 note 32:3 notice 20:18 November 4:1 32:1 number 14:22 15:7, 14 21:3 numbering 19:2</p> <p>< O > obviously 17:3 20:11 October 1:12 Odutola 12:22 13:2, 7 offer 15:21 Office 3:11, 22 4:6, 21 5:6, 10, 17, 18, 22 6:1, 3,</p>	<p>7, 14, 17, 21 7:3, 9, 13 8:6, 9, 14, 18 12:2, 19 15:2, 3, 6, 11, 22 16:10 17:9, 19 19:18 22:3 28:6, 7 29:1, 9, 13, 18, 20 30:3, 22 31:6 OFFICER 2:7, 9 4:4, 9, 12 5:4, 5 6:13 12:17 18:9 19:6 27:12, 16 28:21 32:9 officers 27:15, 20 28:3, 11 29:2 Offices 11:2 15:10 28:18 30:5 Oftentimes 25:19 26:2 Oh 30:16 Okay 13:14 25:3 open 31:2 operates 32:4 operating 8:3 10:22 operations 10:5 28:12 operators 10:3 opinions 18:19, 20 opportunities 9:13 opportunity 21:22 organization 18:10 27:15, 18</p>
--	---	--	---

<p>organizational 18:6</p> <p>organizations 29:16</p> <p>outcomes 14:17</p> <p>outlines 8:2</p> <p>overarching 25:22</p> <p>oversight 22:10 23:15 24:7 25:15, 22</p> <p>< P ></p> <p>p.m 1:11 32:20</p> <p>PAGE 2:2 11:1</p> <p>part 14:21 16:5 24:4 27:12 28:13 30:1</p> <p>participating 32:11</p> <p>participation 22:14</p> <p>particularly 6:4 7:17 25:15</p> <p>partner 7:10</p> <p>partners 9:17</p> <p>parts 29:3</p> <p>party 24:12</p> <p>pattern 23:14</p> <p>patterns 9:4</p> <p>people 19:1 30:18</p> <p>personal 10:17</p> <p>personally 9:10</p> <p>perspectives 11:12</p> <p>PETs 7:20 9:20</p> <p>phase 14:20</p> <p>phases 14:20</p>	<p>phone 20:19</p> <p>PIA 23:12</p> <p>PIAs 23:16 24:7 25:21</p> <p>place 10:4</p> <p>placement 27:14, 20</p> <p>plan 6:4 7:7, 8, 12, 18 8:2, 8</p> <p>play 18:11</p> <p>playing 18:13 19:4</p> <p>please 3:14, 18 11:20 14:9, 10 20:4, 16 21:13, 15 30:8 31:5 32:3</p> <p>podium 14:2</p> <p>point 17:21</p> <p>points 25:12</p> <p>policies 16:3 23:11</p> <p>Policy 2:18 13:21 28:20</p> <p>portion 3:17 31:16</p> <p>positions 29:3</p> <p>posted 21:9 32:17</p> <p>potential 9:5</p> <p>potentially 18:6</p> <p>practice 22:5 23:21</p> <p>practices 29:20</p> <p>premier 5:22 30:5</p> <p>present 15:1</p> <p>presents 9:12</p> <p>preserving 10:13</p> <p>pressing 20:20</p> <p>previous 17:20</p>	<p>principles 22:5 23:21</p> <p>prior 22:19</p> <p>PRIORITIES 2:8 4:6, 13 6:18</p> <p>PRIVACY 1:4 2:4, 7, 9, 12, 14, 19 3:8, 11, 22 4:4, 6, 9, 12, 15, 21 5:2, 4, 6, 15, 16, 18, 22 6:1, 3, 7, 13, 14, 17, 19, 21 7:4, 9, 13, 15 8:6, 9, 11, 13, 14, 18 9:5, 15, 18, 21 10:3, 4, 10, 12, 21 11:2, 11, 14 12:2, 17, 19 14:1, 13 15:2, 3, 5, 10, 11, 22 16:10 18:9 19:6, 18, 19 21:19, 21 22:3, 10, 18, 21 23:11, 19 24:5, 14 25:14, 16 26:6, 7 27:12, 15, 16, 20 28:3, 6, 7, 10, 18, 21 29:1, 2, 15 30:5, 22 31:6 32:9</p> <p>privacycommitte e@hq.dhs.gov 31:20, 22</p> <p>privacy-enhancing 7:19 8:17 9:1 10:8 15:19</p> <p>privacy-respecting 10:2</p>	<p>private 15:8 18:11</p> <p>privately 13:9</p> <p>PRIV-CATS 10:22 11:1, 4, 6, 9</p> <p>probably 19:8</p> <p>procedures 11:1</p> <p>process 11:3 17:17</p> <p>professionals 15:8</p> <p>program 8:4 10:3 13:20</p> <p>progress 6:21</p> <p>project 6:20 8:16</p> <p>promote 8:20</p> <p>promotes 5:18</p> <p>promoting 7:14</p> <p>proper 18:5</p> <p>protect 5:20 9:18 24:14</p> <p>protecting 7:11, 14 11:15</p> <p>protection 5:19</p> <p>provide 15:11 26:16 30:21 31:5</p> <p>provides 8:4 11:2 24:11</p> <p>providing 9:22</p> <p>provisions 32:4</p> <p>PUBLIC 1:6 2:21 3:15 4:1, 17 5:20 8:1, 5 11:19 16:8 18:4, 10 21:7, 10, 19 25:5 26:3 31:3 32:6,</p>
---	--	---	---

<p>7, 10 publicity 26:4 published 10:20 purchases 23:7 purpose 3:21 20:22 put 3:18 putting 13:15</p> <p>< Q > question 20:5 30:7 QUESTIONS 2:11 12:16, 21 13:2, 12 20:3 21:9 30:15 31:3, 7 quiet 20:13 quite 4:19</p> <p>< R > raise 20:6 raised 21:14 26:12 30:15 raising 3:18 30:6 rapid 19:21 reach 11:21 13:9 reading 14:4 ready 16:13 real 9:4 really 14:16 25:21 26:10 32:13 recap 8:12 recognition 6:12 22:7, 11, 15 23:13 26:13 recommendations</p>	<p>11:20 16:5 18:15 19:18 recommends 24:5 refer 29:17 reflect 6:8 reflection 6:12 regarding 28:4 Register 20:18 21:9 regulation 22:16 regulatory 18:13 related 26:8 relied 20:1 rely 9:15 remains 5:22 7:3 REMARKS 2:3 3:2 12:15 20:17 24:17 29:14 remind 20:21 reminders 3:13 repeat 31:21 replicates 9:4 report 14:21 15:15, 20 16:12, 14, 16 19:5 23:10 28:5, 14 reporting 11:7 27:16, 17 28:4, 6 31:8 reports 24:8 25:17 require 23:5 required 23:16 25:17 26:5 requirements 11:8 26:8 research 14:20</p>	<p>21:20 resilient 12:1 resource 11:7 resources 6:22 8:10 22:3 respect 12:19 26:18 response 13:13 20:8 21:6, 10 24:20 27:5 30:10 31:13 responses 31:6 responsible 10:15 responsibly 10:17 review 6:17 7:6 25:22 27:13 right 13:19 17:14, 21 19:13 20:6, 14, 15 21:8, 14, 21 27:6 28:20 31:9, 14 Rights 5:11, 19 9:5 risks 23:19 24:12 role 6:2 7:5 18:8 roles 29:21 roll 3:4 running 15:12</p> <p>< S > S&T 8:19 safeguard 19:19 safeguarding 7:15 9:10, 15 10:9 11:14</p>	<p>Sandy 3:4 24:21 27:6 30:11 scale 9:3 scenes 20:12 Science 8:14 scope 16:2 Scott 25:7, 8, 10 SDG 9:12 SE 1:19 seconds 13:11 Secretariat 5:9 Secretary 5:5 secure 21:20 securing 7:11 SECURITY 1:1, 18 2:6, 10, 16, 20 5:15 6:5 8:19 9:6 10:16 24:1 see 9:19 10:3 14:17 15:9 18:21 19:15 21:14 26:3 27:9 28:11 seeing 30:14 seeks 9:2 Senator 5:13 send 30:9 sensitive 9:10 serve 5:20 7:9 10:11 11:6 17:12 served 5:8 service 22:21 serving 4:3 18:10 SESSION 2:21 3:17 16:6 20:16, 22 21:5,</p>
--	--	--	--

<p>7 31:15 32:12 settle 23:4 shape 9:4 shared 7:14 short 28:7 shortcomings 22:9 shy 20:5 significant 6:18 19:22 significantly 7:22 Silicon 8:15 smart 9:22 social 17:22 solicitation 8:21 SOP 11:1 Sorry 13:1 sort 13:16 17:8 28:16 29:5 sorts 18:2 Sotto 2:4 3:3 12:8, 13 13:1, 11, 14 19:13 20:9 21:8, 17 24:16, 21 25:3 26:22 27:6, 10, 22 30:6, 11 31:9, 14, 18 sources 10:18 space 8:13 15:8 spaces 19:3 speak 14:15 21:22 26:21 specifically 22:4 spent 5:12 spoke 25:11 staff 5:13 stages 28:22 stakeholders</p>	<p>7:11 8:5 11:19 standard 10:22 start 26:5 starting 14:17 STATEMENTS 2:22 31:17 step-by-step 11:3 stepping 6:2 Stop 1:19 story 23:2 strategic 6:4 7:7 strategies 7:1 strengthen 8:10 strong 7:8 18:19, 20 stronger 12:1 structure 18:6 structures 7:22 Subcommittee 2:14, 18 13:21 28:20 submit 31:18 successfully 11:3 sufficient 24:11 summary 16:20 supportive 12:3 sure 3:19 14:11 28:2 surveillance 23:8 SVIP 8:16, 20 swimmingly 20:10 synthetic 8:22 13:18 System 10:22 systems 9:9, 20 22:13</p>	<p>< T > take 4:5 7:5, 6 14:9 28:1 29:20 takes 26:11 talk 13:9 17:6 talked 15:7 29:12 talking 29:1 task 21:10 tasked 6:13 22:1 TASKING 2:12 6:20 7:4 11:12 12:11 14:1, 3, 13, 16 17:1, 15 20:4 21:2 31:2 taskings 17:20 tasks 13:15, 18 Taylor 25:1, 4, 9 27:8, 11 30:13 teams 16:11 technologies 7:19 8:17 9:14 10:8 15:14, 20 16:2 17:18, 19 18:5 24:10 26:4 Technology 2:13 8:15 9:1, 2 10:14 13:21 17:20 19:22 22:8, 11, 17 23:19 24:13 26:8 Teitzel 2:13 13:22 14:11, 14 19:11 28:2 29:11 30:17 telegraphy 23:10 tenor 13:17</p>	<p>terrific 13:19 test 9:9 Tests 10:4 thank 3:3, 6, 9 4:11, 15 11:10 12:8, 14 13:5, 19 14:11 16:19 19:9 21:22 24:15, 16 26:21, 22 27:1 30:6 31:9 32:19 thankful 16:15 thanks 32:8 thing 14:11 16:21 29:11 things 12:5 15:3 18:2, 3, 17 20:12 26:17, 19 think 12:13 13:15 14:14 16:20 17:2 19:15 20:9 29:9, 11 30:13, 21 31:14 thinking 7:18 13:17 third 6:10 24:12 thought 17:17 thoughtful 11:11 thoughts 11:21 16:9 29:6 31:4, 5 threats 6:9 18:13 three 20:17 threshold 26:6 Thursday 1:12 tied 29:12 time 4:20 5:11 20:3 21:13</p>
---	--	--	--

<p>24:15 25:6 26:21 29:18 timely 8:4 times 17:16 21:3 today 3:6, 21 4:17 16:7 17:7, 18 18:2 21:22 32:11, 12, 16 ton 14:4 tool 10:9 toolbox 10:9 topic 15:16 28:4 Tracking 10:22 train 9:8 trainings 15:19 transparency 5:18 6:6 7:15 10:6, 11 11:15 18:4 treated 32:6 truly 14:5, 6 trust 10:6, 10 18:4 turn 3:14 4:8, 22 13:20 14:1 16:17 19:12 type 8:22</p> <p>< U > U.S 1:1, 18 2:6, 10, 16, 20 5:9 27:12 unbelievable 14:2 underlines 8:6 understand 21:1 22:9 29:5</p>	<p>understanding 18:3 19:20 30:18 understands 7:3 unimaginable 23:4 uniting 12:5 unmute 20:19 unreliable 22:11 24:2 unverified 23:9 UPDATE 2:12 13:19 14:13 updated 10:20 updates 3:22 12:20 13:22 upload 11:3 urges 22:7 use 13:18 18:5 22:5, 7, 17 23:3, 10, 13, 22 24:1 26:8, 12, 13, 14 users 11:9 uses 9:8</p> <p>< V > validity 15:18 Valley 8:15 valuable 11:12, 18 value 10:3 values 7:12, 15 various 5:13 25:15 28:10 verify 23:4 vertical 19:3 view 3:20 viewpoints 21:4 Virtual 1:10 vision 7:8 8:2 vital 11:7</p>	<p>vulnerabilities 24:2</p> <p>< W > want 4:15 6:18 7:2 8:12 11:10 13:9 14:1 16:6 25:11 27:22 31:5, 10 wanted 17:10 warrant 23:6 warrantless 23:8 Washington 1:20 watch 30:2 way 9:7 19:22 26:2 31:1 ways 8:9 webpage 32:16 welcome 3:7 13:3, 4, 7 well 3:11, 20 13:10 14:15 15:10, 12, 21 17:13 18:7, 14 19:3, 7, 13 20:15 24:7 25:16 26:14 27:20 31:14 well-rounded 19:4 went 29:15 widely 22:20 widespread 23:1 wish 3:15 work 3:10, 11 5:17 6:19 8:13, 16 11:11 12:2, 9 21:4 24:4 32:15</p>	<p>worked 5:9 17:8 18:16 workforce 6:10 8:7 working 4:21 5:12, 13 13:3 15:14 16:11, 16 19:16 28:22 29:4, 22 31:2 works 21:20 worldwide 13:17 worse 23:2 wrap 11:10 27:7 30:12 wrapped 12:15 written 31:19 32:5 wrongful 22:12</p> <p>< Y > year 5:12 6:7, 14 8:13 years 6:15 7:2 17:2, 3, 4 19:2 26:17 29:7 30:2</p>
--	---	---	--